

## **School-Based Management: A Literature Review of Its Implementation and Impact on School Organizational Effectiveness**

**Eka Saputra<sup>1</sup>, Puji Hartati<sup>1</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Universitas Bengkulu, Bengkulu, Indonesia

Corresponding author e-mail: [ekasaputra0919@gmail.com](mailto:ekasaputra0919@gmail.com)

Article History: Received on 18 August 2024, Revised on 19 October 2024

Published on 14 November 2024

**Abstract:** The purpose of this study is to describe the general patterns underlying the success of school-based management (SBM) implementation, as well as to identify the main challenges that often arise in its implementation. Thus, this study can provide an important contribution in understanding the dynamics of SBM and its implications for efforts to improve the quality of school management and the effectiveness of educational organizations at the local level. This study presents a systematic review of school-based management literature through the collection, documentation, examination, and analysis of research publications. The results of the study show that SBM can improve the effectiveness of school organizations through decentralization of decision making, increased community participation, and increased accountability. However, the success of SBM is greatly influenced by contextual factors, such as resource support, principal managerial competence, and stakeholder involvement. While SBM is able to improve the quality of school management and organizational culture, its impact on student learning outcomes has not been consistent. In addition, the increasing bureaucratic burden and declining teacher morale are challenges that require attention in the implementation of SBM.

**Keywords:** Effectiveness of School Organization, Literature Review, School Based Management

### **A. Introduction**

The concept of educational management has undergone significant development along with the increasing need for more efficient and responsive school management to the demands of change. Quality education has become an urgent need in modern society, especially in the era of globalization that demands competent and adaptive human resources. According to (David, 1989), one of the approaches widely adopted to improve the quality of education is School-Based Management (SBM). This approach focuses on the decentralization of school management, where schools are given greater autonomy in determining their policies and internal management (Gropello, 2006).

SBM aims to improve the effectiveness of school organizations by prioritizing the participation of all stakeholders, including principals, teachers, students, and the surrounding community (Gropello, 2006). According to Dimmock (1993), this concept is believed to be able to increase school responsiveness to local needs, strengthen accountability, and promote innovation in the management of educational resources. Several studies have shown that the implementation of MBS can bring positive changes in school management, such as increasing parental and community involvement in the educational process (Martin, 2019), as well as improvements in financial and human resource management (Robertson & Briggs, 1998).

The success of SBM in many countries, including Indonesia, is highly dependent on the ability of schools to manage the autonomy given (Husni et al., 2024). However, Cheng and Chan (2000) review show that SBM has succeeded in improving school performance, especially in terms of operational efficiency, learning quality, and achieving better educational outcomes. According to Zohriah et al. (2023), this is due to various factors, including the availability of resources, the ability of school principal managers, and support from the central and local governments.

Empirical research has shown that the impact of MBS implementation on the effectiveness of school organizations varies widely. Factors such as socio-cultural context (Navarro et al., 2024), level of community participation (Tansiri & Bong, 2019), and support from national education policies influence the extent to which MBS can run effectively (Ferriswara et al., 2024).

Research on SBM is often limited to a specific geographic or cultural context, so the results may not be generalizable to different educational settings (Dones et al., 2023). Differences in educational policy structures, school resources, and community participation cultures influence how SBM is implemented and how effective its impact is (Carr-Hill et al., 2018). Therefore, research conducted in one country or region may not fully reflect the challenges and successes of SBM implementation in other places (Cheng & Chan, 2000). In addition, some studies use qualitative methods, such as interviews and observations, which can produce biased or subjective results. Meanwhile, quantitative research may only focus on certain aspects of school organizational effectiveness and not fully capture the more complex dynamics of SBM (Carr-Hill et al., 2018).

Through this literature review, it is expected to find general patterns underlying the success of MBS implementation, as well as identify the main challenges that often arise in its implementation. Thus, this study will provide an important contribution in understanding the dynamics of MBS and its implications for efforts to improve the quality of school management and the effectiveness of educational organizations at the local level.

## **B. Methods**

This study uses literature study as a method. The purpose of this study is to review and analyze literature relevant to the field being studied. This study analyzes existing data in the form of articles, journals, books, and other library sources. Literature review, also called meta-analysis, is a research design that requires searching, selecting, and evaluating literature relevant to the research topic. Research can be conducted systematically by using clear standards for selecting literature to be analyzed.

Researchers can access literature from various sources and in various time periods, so the location and time of this research are not limited. This research utilizes literature that is relevant to the selected topic. Inclusion and exclusion criteria can be used to select the most relevant and high-quality literature for research. The data used in this study comes from previous literature collected from various sources, including books, research reports, scientific journals, and other sources. Researchers can search for literature that is in accordance with the research topic by utilizing academic databases such as PubMed or Google Scholar. After researchers find relevant literature, then make choices based on previously established criteria. To conduct data analysis in this study, the selected literature must be read and evaluated thoroughly. Researchers will find important results from each study, compare and integrate findings from other studies, and then synthesize or summarize the results. Depending on the purpose of the research and the type of literature available, the analysis can be done narratively, thematically, or through meta-analysis.

## **C. Results and Discussion**

To conduct this study, articles published on PubMed or Google Scholar related to the implementation and impact of school-based management were evaluated. The following table shows the literature review:

**Table 1. Literature Study Analysis**

No.	Author (Year)	Title	Research Type	Description
1.	(Grauwe, 2005)	Improving The Quality of Education Through School-Based Management: Learning from International Experiences	Qualitative	Strategies that should accompany school-based management to ensure a positive impact on: (1) ensuring that all schools have certain basic resources; (2) developing effective school support systems; (3) providing schools with regular information about their performance and suggestions on how to improve their performance;

No.	Author (Year)	Title	Research Type	Description
2.	(Dimmock, 1993)	School-Based Management and School Effectiveness	Qualitative	and (4) emphasizing the motivational element in the work of school principals. Effective leadership enhances educational change and school culture. Then delegates financial management to improve teaching and learning outcomes.
3.	(Wohlstetter, 1995)	Getting School-Based Management Right: What Works and What Doesn't	Qualitative	Successful SBM requires redesigning the school organization beyond governance changes. Furthermore, authority must impact directly on improving teaching and learning.
4.	(Robertson & Briggs, 1998)	Improving Schools Through School-Based Management: An Examination of the Process of Change	Qualitative	SBM leads to improved decision-making processes in schools. Positive changes in school culture improve staff behavior and outcomes.
5.	(Pushpanadham, 2006)	Educational leadership for school-based management	Qualitative	One strategy for achieving this goal is found in School Based Management, a decentralized school administration model that provides clear guidelines and has been successfully introduced in a number of countries.
6.	(Nir, 2002)	The Impact of School-Based Management on School Health	Qualitative	This study found no significant overall change in school health implementation post-SBM, but teachers experienced lower morale and increased bureaucratic burden, which impacted organizational effectiveness.
7.	(Sayuti, 2020)	Implementation of School Based Management to Improve Education Quality (Case Study in Special Schools)	Qualitative	School Based Management encourages active, independent and accountable schools. Then innovative strategies in the 2013 curriculum were developed for blind students.
8.	(Yusuf et al., 2018)	The mediating effect of school-based management on school climate, bureaucracy and effectiveness in secondary schools	Quantitative	School-based management mediates the relationship between bureaucracy and school effectiveness, increasing organizational effectiveness, while it does not mediate between school climate and effectiveness.
9.	(Botha, 2011)	Contextual Factors in the Assessment of the Effect of	Qualitative	The assessment of the impact of school-based management on organisational effectiveness in

No.	Author (Year)	Title	Research Type	Description
		School-based Management on School Effectiveness		South African schools remains under-explored, highlighting the need for further research on the contextual influences that affect school effectiveness.
10.	(Hamengkubuwono, 2021)	School Based Management Within the Framework of Autonomy at SMP Negeri 1 Rejang Lebong	Qualitative	School-based management improves organizational effectiveness through improved planning, community involvement, and resource management, while challenges such as student discipline remain. Schools effectively implement school-based management functions. Supporting factors: committees, parents, community, teaching staff, facilities.
11.	(Herman & Herman, 1992)	Educational Administration: School-Based Management	Qualitative	School-based management leads to decentralized decision making, where sharing of information helps teachers understand student motivations and personal issues. Effective schools emphasize empowering school staff for innovation.
12.	(Hadijaya, 2015)	School Based Management at Matauli 1 State Senior High School Pandan	Qualitative	The impact of SBM on student learning outcomes is inconclusive. Teachers report lower morale and increased bureaucratic burden with SBM. The effectiveness of SBM implementation depends on the active participation of all elements of education.
13.	(Suyata, 2017)	School-Based Management for Generating Improved Learning Outcomes of All Pupils by Improving Good Teaching and Learning Practices	Qualitative	School-based management programs (SBM) have limited power to improve teaching and learning practices. Contextual and historical backgrounds play an important role in the success of SBM implementation.
14.	(Katuuk et al., 2019)	The Analysis of School-Based Management Implementation and Principals' Managerial Competencies	Qualitative	This study shows that the effectiveness of School Based Management is closely related to the managerial competencies of principals, which are currently lacking in effectiveness in several key areas that impact organizational performance.

No.	Author (Year)	Title	Research Type	Description
15.	(Katuuk et al., 2018)	Effectiveness of School-Based Management Practices in Increasing Community Participation and Implementing School Programs	Qualitative	School Based Management (SBM) practices are effective in increasing community participation. SBM is effective in improving the implementation of school programs. This effectiveness is influenced by management policies, guidelines, and sustainable development programs.

School-Based Management (SBM) is a decentralized approach that gives schools greater autonomy in resource management and decision-making, with the aim of increasing community participation and educational quality (Tansiri & Bong, 2019). Various studies have been conducted to understand how SBM affects the effectiveness of school organizations in various contexts. Grauwe (2005) emphasized the importance of supporting strategies such as ensuring schools have sufficient resources, building effective support systems, and providing regular information on school performance. This aims to maximize the positive impact of SBM on the effectiveness of school organizations. Similarly, Dimmock (1993) argued that effective leadership, which encourages changes in school culture and delegation of financial management, contributes to improved learning outcomes.

Schools have greater responsibility in managing funds and resources, and in ensuring that policies taken are in accordance with expected educational standards (Wohlstetter & Odden, 1992). This accountability includes transparent reporting on school performance to relevant parties, so that evaluation and quality improvement can be carried out continuously (Wohlstetter, 1995).

Wohlstetter (1995) also asserts that the success of SBM requires changes beyond just governance; there must be a redesign of the school organization to directly affect the quality of teaching and learning. This is in line with the view of Robertson dan Briggs (1998) who stated that SBM leads to better decision making, with positive impacts on school culture and staff behavior.

Pushpanadham (2006) highlighted that SBM is one of the strategies that has been successfully implemented in several countries as a model of school administration decentralization, while Nir (2002) found that although SBM does not always bring significant changes to school health, teachers often experience decreased morale and increased bureaucratic burdens, which affect organizational effectiveness. Research in Indonesia by Sayuti (2020) and Yusuf (2018) shows that SBM can encourage schools to be more independent and accountable, and increase organizational effectiveness through mediation between bureaucracy and school effectiveness. However, not all factors such as school climate can be influenced by SBM.

SBM seeks to improve the effectiveness of school organizations by giving schools more autonomy in decision-making. This decentralization allows schools to be more flexible in managing resources, adopting policies, and adapting teaching and learning practices according to local needs (Dones et al., 2023). One of the positive impacts of SBM is increased community participation. By involving the community, parents, and other stakeholders in the decision-making process, schools can build a sense of shared ownership and strengthen accountability. The active participation of this community also helps schools in implementing educational programs that are relevant to their social environment (Ferriswara et al., 2024).

In South Africa, Botha (2011) found that the impact of SBM on organizational effectiveness still requires further research, especially to understand the contextual factors that influence its implementation. Meanwhile, Hamengkubuwono (2021) highlighted that better planning, community involvement, and effective resource management contributed to increased school effectiveness, although challenges such as student discipline problems remained. According to Gropello (2006), one of the main factors is adequate resource support. Schools need financial support, facilities, and competent educators to implement SBM effectively. Limited resources are often a major obstacle, especially in schools with less supportive economic conditions.

Herman and Herman (1992) stated that SBM encourages decentralized decision-making and empowers staff to innovate. However, Hadijaya (2015) and Suyata (2017) noted that the impact of SBM on student learning outcomes is not always convincing. Increasing bureaucratic burdens and declining teacher morale are obstacles to the effectiveness of SBM. More complex administrative processes and the need to manage school autonomy independently can burden teachers, which ultimately impacts their morale. This decline in morale is a serious challenge, because less motivated teachers tend to have lower performance, which directly affects the quality of teaching.

Katuuk et al. (2018, 2019) stated that the effectiveness of MBS is greatly influenced by the principal's managerial competence and management policies. Principals who have good managerial skills are able to manage the autonomy given effectively, optimize the use of resources, and lead with a clear vision. Conversely, principals who are less competent may face difficulties in maximizing the potential of MBS, which ultimately impacts the performance of the school organization.

Although SBM has great potential to improve the performance of educational institutions, its success is highly dependent on the context in which it is implemented. Principal management skills, active stakeholder involvement, and adequate resource support are important factors. On the other hand, for SBM to truly have a positive impact on all aspects of education, including student learning

outcomes, issues such as bureaucratic burden and declining teacher morale must be addressed properly.

#### **D. Conclusion**

School-based management (SBM) can improve the effectiveness of school organizations through decentralization of decision-making, increased community participation, and enhanced accountability. However, the success of SBM is highly influenced by contextual factors, such as resource support, principal managerial competence, and stakeholder involvement. While SBM can improve the quality of school management and organizational culture, its impact on student learning outcomes has not been consistent. In addition, the increasing bureaucratic burden and declining teacher morale are challenges that require attention in the implementation of SBM.

#### **E. Acknowledgements**

Thank you for the opportunity given to complete the writing of this literature study. Hopefully the results presented can provide a meaningful contribution to the development of science and be useful in the field of educational administration.

#### **References**

- Botha, R. J. (2011). Contextual Factors in the Assessment of the Effect of School-based Management on School Effectiveness. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 27(1), 15–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09718923.2011.11892902>
- Carr-Hill, R., Rolleston, C., Schendel, R., & Waddington, H. (2018). The effectiveness of school-based decision making in improving educational outcomes: a systematic review. *Journal of Development Effectiveness*, 10(1), 61–94. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19439342.2018.1440250>
- Cheng, Y. C., & Chan, M. T. (2000). Implementation of School-Based Management: A Multi-Perspective Analysis of the Case of Hong Kong. *International Review of Education*, 46(2), 205–232. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1004046223339>
- David, J. L. (1989). Synthesis of Research on School-Based Management. *Educational Leadership*, 12(3), 45–55.
- Dimmock, C. (1993). *School-Based Management and School Effectiveness*. Routledge.
- Dones, M. D., Estremera, M. L., & Deuda, M. J. D. (2023). School-Based Management Perspectives: Exploring Top-down Policy Execution at the Grassroots Level. *European Journal of Educational Management*, volume-6-2(volume-6-issue-2-june-2023-6), 101–118. <https://doi.org/10.12973/eujem.6.2.101>

- Ferriswara, D., Ambarwati, A., Roekminiati, S., & Devy Pramudiana, I. (2024). School Committees' Effectiveness in the Context of School-based Management Policy. *KnE Social Sciences*, 25(5), 1-10. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v9i7.15533>
- Grauwe, A. De. (2005). Improving The Quality of Education Through School-Based Management: Learning From International Experiences. *International Review of Education*, 51(4), 269-287. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11159-005-7733-1>
- Gropello, E. Di. (2006). *A Comparative Analysis of School-based Management in Central America*. World Bank working paper.
- Hadijaya, Y. (2015). School Based Management at Matauli 1 State Senior High School Pandan. *Researchers World – Journal of Arts Science & Commerce*, 2(1), 55-66. <https://doi.org/10.18843/rwjasc/v6i4/08>
- Hamengkubuwono. (2021). School Based Management Within The Framework of Autonomy at SMP Negeri 1 Rejang Lebong. *Tadbir: Jurnal Studi Manajemen Pendidikan*, 5(1), 55-65. <https://doi.org/10.29240/jsmp.v5i1.2601>
- Herman, J. J., & Herman, J. L. (1992). Educational Administration: School-Based Management. *The Clearing House: A Journal of Educational Strategies, Issues and Ideas*, 65(5), 261-263. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00098655.1992.10114219>
- Husni, I. N., Giatman, M., & Ernawati, E. (2024). Analisis Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah pada Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan: Studi Literatur. *Journal of Education Research*, 5(3), 3170-3180. <https://doi.org/10.37985/jer.v5i3.1456>
- Katuuk, Pasandaran, S., Lonto, A., & Sendouw, R. (2019). The Analysis of School-Based Management Implementation and Principals' Managerial Competencies. *Proceedings of the International Conference on Social Science 2019 (ICSS 2019)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icss-19.2019.248>
- Katuuk, Pasandaran, S., & Pangalila, T. (2018). Effectiveness of School-Based Management Practices in Increasing Community Participation and Implementing School Programs. *Proceedings of the Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/acec-18.2018.32>
- Martin, M. (2019). The Implementation Of School-Based Management In Public Elementary Schools. *Asian Journal of Assessment in Teaching and Learning*, 9(1), 44-56. <https://doi.org/10.37134/ajatel.vol9.no1.5.2019>
- Navarro, J. A., Saking, M. B., Mateo, M. W., Ramos, M. B., & Banggawan, E. K. (2024). Exploring How Elementary School Principals Use School-Based Management To Lead Adaptively. *Cognizance Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies*, 4(3), 228-243. <https://doi.org/10.47760/cognizance.2024.v04i03.021>

- Nir, A. E. (2002). The Impact of School-Based Management on School Health. *Journal of School Leadership*, 12(4), 368–396. <https://doi.org/10.1177/105268460201200402>
- Pushpanadham, K. (2006). Educational leadership for school based management. *ABAC Journal*, 26(1), 41–48.
- Robertson, P. J., & Briggs, K. L. (1998). Improving Schools Through School-Based Management: An Examination of the Process of Change. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 9(1), 28–57. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0924345980090102>
- Sayuti, M. (2020). Implementation of School Based Management to Improve Education Quality (Case Study in Special Schools). *Journal of K6 Education and Management*, 3(4), 411–423. <https://doi.org/10.11594/jk6em.03.04.01>
- Suyata. (2017). School-Based Management for Generating Improved Learning Outcomes of All Pupils by Improving Good Teaching and Learning Practices. *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Educational Management and Administration (CoEMA 2017)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/coema-17.2017.35>
- Tansiri, I. Y., & Bong, Y. J. (2019). The Analysis of School-Based Management (SBM) Implementation to the Educational Quality Service of State Junior High School. *Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Research of Educational Administration and Management (ICREAM 2018)*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icream-18.2019.89>
- Wohlstetter, P. (1995). Getting School-Based Management Right: What Works and What Doesn't. *JSTOR Collection*1, 77(1), 22–24.
- Wohlstetter, P., & Odden, A. (1992). Rethinking School-Based Management Policy and Research. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 28(4), 529–549. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0013161X92028004005>
- Yusuf, H. A., Amzat, I. H., & Saidin, K. B. (2018). The mediating effect of school-based management on school climate, bureaucracy and effectiveness in secondary schools. *Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Management*, 7(3), 19–42.
- Zohriah, A., Syamsudin, D. A., & Firdaos, R. (2023). Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah pada Satuan Pendidikan. *Tarbiatuna: Journal of Islamic Education Studies*, 4(1), 11–18. <https://doi.org/10.47467/tarbiatuna.v4i1.4382>